

Application Number: 18/11690 Full Planning Permission

Site: CLUB HOUSE, NEW FOREST WATER PARK,
RINGWOOD ROAD, FORDINGBRIDGE SP6 2EY

Development: Three-storey extension; extend side dormers; balcony; rooflights;
garage/store

Applicant: Mr Jury

Target Date: 08/03/2019

Extension Date: 12/04/2019

RECOMMENDATION: Refuse

Case Officer: Stephen Belli

1 REASON FOR COMMITTEE CONSIDERATION

Contrary to Town Council view.

2 DEVELOPMENT PLAN AND OTHER CONSTRAINTS

Countryside
Avon Catchment Area
Flood Zone

3 DEVELOPMENT PLAN, OBJECTIVES AND POLICIES

Objectives

1. Special qualities, local distinctiveness and a high quality living environment
7. The countryside

Core Strategy

CS1 – Sustainable development principle
CS2: Design quality
CS3: Protecting and enhancing our special environment (Heritage and Nature Conservation)
CS6: Flood risk
CS10: The spatial strategy
CS24: Transport considerations

Local Plan Part 2 Sites and Development Management Development Plan Document

NPPF1 - presumption in favour of sustainable development
DM2: Nature conservation, biodiversity and geodiversity
DM20 Residential accommodation in the countryside

4 RELEVANT LEGISLATION AND GOVERNMENT ADVICE

Section 38 Development Plan
Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004
National Planning Policy Framework

5 RELEVANT SUPPLEMENTARY PLANNING GUIDANCE AND DOCUMENTS

SPD Housing Design Guidance

6 RELEVANT PLANNING HISTORY

- 6.1 **18/11130** - Clubhouse and additional accommodation for fishery manager - refused 09/01/19 (middle lake - Committee report January 2019 refers)
- 6.2 **16/10025** - Clubhouse with additional use for fishery manager accommodation refused 13/03/16 – appeal dismissed 19/01/17 (middle lake)
- 6.3 **15/11649** – Single storey extension to clubhouse with balcony over – approved 28/01/16 (main site)
- 6.4 **13/10191** - Clubhouse - granted 13/05/13 (middle lake)
- 6.5 **10/96273** - Clubhouse - granted outline planning permission 1/06/11 (middle lake)
- 6.6 **99/67058** – Garage/store building – approved 24/09/99 (main site - limited use by condition)
- 6.7 **57062** - Vary Condition 9 on 41232 (jet & water skiing use) – granted 09/08/95
- 6.8 **53713** – 1st floor addition with rooms in roof to form owner's accommodation – approved 09/03/94 (main site)
- 6.9 **52288** - Vary Condition 9 on 41232 to allow jet skiing - granted 14/7/93
- 6.10 **51715** – 1st floor addition to clubhouse to form owner's accommodation – approved 04/01/94 (main site - approved subject to supplemental S106 restricting occupation of flat)
- 6.11 **44205** – Erect two storey water sports clubhouse, parking and landscaping – approved 04/03/91 (Reserved Matters) (main site on northern lake)
- 6.12 **41232** – Change of use of former gravel pits to water based recreation and erection of clubhouse - granted 13/12/90 (Parent outline permission) (main site on northern lake – approved subject to S106 agreement on use of lakes)

7 PARISH / TOWN COUNCIL COMMENTS

Fordingbridge Town Council: recommend that permission is granted as there is a benefit for local jobs and the economy. Fordingbridge Town Council recommend the enhanced accommodation should be tied to use by staff.

8 COUNCILLOR COMMENTS

None received.

9 CONSULTEE COMMENTS

9.1 Natural England

No objection subject to mitigation and relevant conditions. Their comments in relation to the previous application also apply to this application as follows:

Response to 18/11130 - Note the site lies immediately adjacent to the Avon Valley Special Protection Area (SPA) and Ramsar and in close proximity to the New Forest SPA, Ramsar and Special Area of Conservation. Natural England are satisfied with the Council's mitigation strategy and Habitat Regulations Assessment.

On other matters Natural England notes the presence of an SSSI adjacent to the site but is satisfied that the development will not be harmful provided a condition is imposed regarding any percussive piling operations. Natural England recommend that due regard is also taken in respect of biodiversity net gain and advice set out as well as Standing Advice dealing with protected species.

9.2 Environmental Health

No concerns

10 REPRESENTATIONS RECEIVED

None received

11 CRIME & DISORDER IMPLICATIONS

Not relevant on this occasion

12 LOCAL FINANCE CONSIDERATIONS

Local financial considerations are not material to the decision on this application

13 WORKING WITH THE APPLICANT/AGENT

In accordance with paragraph 38 of the National Planning Policy Framework and Article 35 of the Town and Country Planning (Development Management Procedure) (England) Order 2015, New Forest District Council takes a positive and proactive approach, seeking solutions to any problems arising in the handling of development proposals so as to achieve, whenever possible, a positive outcome by giving clear advice to applicants.

In this case all the above apply. The applicant did not avail himself of the

Council's pre application advice service. The Council has sought further justification for the proposal as well as further consideration of design matters but this has not resulted in any information forthcoming from the applicant to set aside the reasons for refusal as set out.

14 ASSESSMENT

14.1 Site description

14.1.1 The New Forest Water Park is situated at Hucklesbrook Lakes in the open countryside, and comprises a collection of three lakes on the west side of the A338 Ringwood to Fordingbridge Road, between this highway and the River Avon. The Water Park specifically occupies the two northern lakes. The southern lake is used for fishing and is in separate ownership. The northern lake is now used for water sports whilst the middle lake is used for fishing purposes. The lakes were formed over 20 years ago from old gravel extraction pits, and they are surrounded by banks of maturing deciduous vegetation. There is an existing clubhouse building adjacent to the north-western corner of the northern lake (referred to as the main site). The land to the west of the lakes is within the Avon Valley flood plain and is a designated Site of Special Scientific Interest (SSSI) and Special Protection Area (SPA).

14.1.2 Since their formation in the early 1990s, the lakes have been used for water based recreation. The original 1990 planning permission restricted noise generating water based activities (water skiing and jet skiing) to just the northernmost lake. A subsequent application in 1995 permitted the middle lake to be used for jet skiing providing that jet skiing on the middle lake does not take place at the same time as upon the northern lake. This 1995 permission also precluded jet skiing taking place on the western part of the middle lake, primarily for nature conservation reasons. At present the Water Park is only open from Easter to early November.

14.1.3 The main site has a collection of buildings as follows

- A large two/three storey building including manager's accommodation on 1st and 2nd floor with changing rooms, commercial storage, boat shed, lockers, workshop, kit store and shop on the ground floor. This building also includes a customer reception, bar, commercial kitchen, eating facilities, toilets, and family room on the 1st floor. This building has a large outdoor amenity area for customers overlooking the northern lake.
- Within the grounds of the main site are a collection of three mobile homes used for staff accommodation, as well as another building which includes a residential flat, and another large garage/storage building with residential accommodation on the first floor. One static caravan is used by the site caretaker and this together with the other two caravans are either immune from enforcement action or are occupied as seasonal staff accommodation considered at the time as not needing planning permission. A residential flat created in one of the outbuildings has become immune over the passage of time. The flat above the garage and store building is also occupied and it is not clear if there is a planning permission for this residential unit.

- The main site is served by its own access road and large customer car park.

14.1.4 The current site manager accommodation floorspace comprises a lounge, bathroom, study, and 4 no. bedrooms with one en-suite on the 2nd floor. The accommodation is arranged over two floors and is in line with permission 53713 noted above granted in March 1994. The accommodation has an internal floorspace, excluding any stairwell, of 110 square metres (1184 square feet).

14.2 Proposals

14.2.1 The proposal is to extend the existing manager's accommodation at the rear of the clubhouse to provide improvements to bedroom accommodation and kitchen facilities, as well as a further en-suite facility to one of the bedrooms. The existing clubhouse has its own kitchen facility and this is at present also being used by the manager for their own personal needs. The number of bedrooms overall stays at four.

14.2.2 The plans indicate a building clad in brick and timber under a slated roof to match the existing. The new extension would extend the building by 5 metres in length. The existing single dormer window on each elevation would be subsumed into a new triple dormer on each side elevation. A new balcony area with an extended roof over would be formed at 2nd floor level.

14.2.3 The extended floorspace over two floors measures some 66 square metres (710 square feet). This would if permitted result in manager's accommodation of some 174 square metres (1894 square feet). This equates to a 60% increase in the accommodation floorspace. This does not include the large new domestic garage/store at ground level which measures an additional 43 square metres (462 square feet).

14.2.4 The plans as submitted also are inaccurate in a number of areas particularly in relation to the labelling of rooms within the building and some minor elevational details which do not tie up with floor plans. These points have been made to the applicant but with no corrected plans submitted.

14.2.5 This application has been submitted without the benefit of any pre application advice.

14.3 Key Issues

The key issues with this application are the principle of development in this open countryside location, and design considerations including the impact on character and appearance of the existing building and the immediate area.

14.3.1 Principle of development

14.3.1.1 a) Policy considerations

With regard to the principle of development the site is in the countryside where normal policies of restraint on development apply.

DM20 allows for residential accommodation in the countryside in certain circumstances such as for agricultural, affordable housing, a replacement dwelling or the limited extension of an existing dwelling. The policy is set out below.

Policy DM20: Residential development in the countryside will only be permitted where it is:

- a) a limited extension to an existing dwelling; or*
- b) the replacement of an existing dwelling, except where it:*
 - (i) is the result of a temporary permission(s); and/or*
 - (ii) is an unauthorised use; and/or*
 - (iii) it has been abandoned; or*
- c) affordable housing to meet a local need, in accordance with Core Strategy Policy CS22; or*
- d) an agricultural worker's or forestry worker's dwelling in accordance with Policy DM21.*

In all cases, development should be of an appropriate design, scale and appearance in keeping with the rural character of the area, and should not be harmful to the rural character of the area by reason of traffic and other activity generated or other impacts.

Replacement dwellings and dwelling extensions should not normally provide for an increase in floorspace of more than 30%. A dwelling may be permitted to exceed the 30% limit provided the increased floorspace will not result in a dwelling in excess of 100 sq. metres floorspace. In all cases proposals should be designed to respect the character and scale of the existing dwelling, and not significantly alter the impact of built development on the site within its setting.

The 30% limit is applied as a limit to all cumulative extensions since 1 July 1982. In exceptional circumstances, a larger extension may be permitted to:

- (i) meet the genuine family needs of an occupier who works in the immediate locality; or*
- (ii) meet the design considerations relating to the special character of the building e.g. listed buildings.*

The proposal as now presented represents a substantial 60% increase in the existing managers accommodation without any submitted justification. Design issues are dealt with below but it is clear from the above that the proposal does not comply with the relevant development plan policy. Whilst it is noted that the flat does not currently have its own dedicated kitchen this could be provided by re-jigging the available floorspace without needing an extension.

14.3.1.2 b) Occupation of manager accommodation

The Town Council raise no objection to the application provided that the unit as enlarged is tied by condition to staff, and there is a need to do so in an open countryside location such as this.

Members are also asked to note the current quantum of available residential and staff accommodation on the site. It is clear that there is a substantial amount of accommodation. The justification for such a large increase in floorspace to the manager's maisonette accommodation is therefore questionable.

These points have been addressed to the applicant but no further justification has been provided.

14.3.2 Design considerations

14.3.2.1 Policy CS2 of the Core Strategy states the following -

New development will be required to be well designed to respect the character, identity, and context of the area's towns, villages and countryside. All new development will be required to contribute positively to local distinctiveness and sense of place, being appropriate and sympathetic to its setting in terms of scale, height, density, layout, appearance, materials, and its relationship to adjoining buildings and landscape features, and shall not cause unacceptable effects by reason of visual intrusion, overlooking, shading, noise, light pollution or other adverse impact on local character and amenities.

14.3.2.2. The current proposal would be visible from the car park and its position towards the rear of the site should not be used to allow poor design. The plans indicate a large bulky extension which would considerably increase the mass of the building. The extension would unbalance this side elevation view and when combined with the inappropriate roof feature of a triple dormer on two elevations is considered to be poor design, inconsistent with policy. The site does benefit from a backdrop of trees and so in the wider landscape context there would be no harmful impact. While the impact on local character and appearance is therefore limited to that closer to the building this in itself should not be used as a reason to support poor design which degrades the local environment.

14.3.2.3 Concerns have been initially expressed to the applicant regarding the triple dormers but no substantive response has been received. It is considered that the overall mass and bulk of the extension is not acceptable and consequently that design objections should be raised.

14.4 Conclusions

14.4.1 This application raises issues relating to the principle of further residential development in the countryside which in all cases should be properly justified. The site already benefits from a considerable amount of staff and manager accommodation and there is no overriding reason for allowing a substantial further increase in the manager's accommodation. Secondly, the mass and bulk of the extension with its detailing, exhibits poor design quality, contrary to stated policies.

14.4.2 The proposal has been the subject of a recommendation of approval by the Town Council. The comments they make in support of this rural business would be worthy of support if there was no current staff or manager accommodation. However, for the reasons set out above it is considered that permission should, on this occasion, be refused.

- 14.4.3 In coming to this recommendation, consideration has been given to the rights set out in Article 8 (Right to respect for private and family life) and Article 1 of the First Protocol (Right to peaceful enjoyment of possessions) of the European Convention on Human Rights. Whilst it is recognised that this recommendation, if agreed, may interfere with the rights and freedoms of the applicant to develop the land in the way proposed, the objections to the planning application are serious ones and cannot be overcome by the imposition of conditions. The public interest and the rights and freedoms of neighbouring property owners can only be safeguarded by the refusal of permission.

15. RECOMMENDATION

Refuse

Reason(s) for Refusal:

1. The proposal is for a large extension to an existing manager's accommodation unit within this rural business based in the open countryside. In such areas Policy DM20 of the New Forest District Council Local Plan part 2 requires that such extensions should not be more than 30% of the existing dwelling. This proposal represents a 60% increase over the existing floorspace (excluding the domestic garage and store). Special consideration of any residential accommodation in the countryside is required. In this case the site already benefits from a significant amount of staff and manager accommodation and it is considered that there is no overriding justification to support such a large percentage increase in accommodation at this site.
2. The proposal by virtue of its size, design, bulk and mass is considered to represent poor design that detracts from the character and appearance of the existing building and the rural character of the area, inconsistent with policy CS2 of the New Forest Core Strategy and Policy DM20 of the New Forest Local Plan part 2 which 'inter alia' requires development proposals to be well designed and to contribute positively to local distinctiveness and sense of place, and the rural character of the area.

Notes for inclusion on certificate:

1. In accordance with paragraph 38 of the National Planning Policy Framework and Article 35 of the Town and Country Planning (Development Management Procedure) (England) Order 2015, New Forest District Council takes a positive and proactive approach, seeking solutions to any problems arising in the handling of development proposals so as to achieve, whenever possible, a positive outcome by giving clear advice to applicants.

In this case all the above apply. The applicant did not avail himself of the Council's pre application advice service. The Council has sought further justification for the proposal as well as further consideration of design matters but this has not resulted in any information forthcoming from the applicant to set aside the reasons for refusal as set out.

Further Information:

Stephen Belli

Telephone: 023 8028 5588



New Forest DISTRICT COUNCIL

Tel: 023 8028 5000
www.newforest.gov.uk

David Groom
Service Manager
Planning and Building Control
New Forest District Council
Appletree Court
Lyndhurst
SO43 7PA

**Planning Development
Control Committee**
April 2019

Item No: 3c
Club House
New Forest Water Park
Fordingbridge
18/11690

Scale 1:6000

N.B. If printing this plan from
the internet, it will not be to
scale.

